
**Arizona Real Estate Advisory Board
Meeting Minutes**

Wednesday
January 18, 2023
10:00 a.m. - Noon
Arizona Department of Real Estate
Telephonically- Google Meet and In
Person
100 North 15th Avenue Suite 201
Phoenix, Arizona 85007

I. Call to Order – Bill Gray, Chair

Chair Gray called the meeting to order at 10:00 am.

II. Introductions & Welcome

Bill Gray, Chair

Charlie Bowles, Vice Chair

Kim Clifton

Judy Jackson – Telephonically

Matias Rosales - Telephonically

Christine Shipley

D. Christopher Ward

Absent:

Carla Bowen

Luis Ramirez Thomas

Justin Rollins

ADRE Representatives present:

Louis Dettorre, Commissioner

James Knupp, Deputy Commissioner (DC)

Abby Hansen, Chief of Staff (COS)

Daniel Jones, Manager Enforcement and Compliance

Marlee McCormick, Manager Licensing Services (MLS)

Chandni Bhakta, Legislative Liaison

Members of the Public present:

Nikki Salgat, General Counsel for the Arizona Association of REALTORS® (AAR)

III. Presentation and Discussion of Annual Advisory Board Overview and New Member Welcome, Guide for Real Estate Advisory Board Members as Facilitators, and Conflict of Interest Disclosures.

Chair Gray, Vice Chair Bowles and Member Clifton all referenced previous presentations by the Assistant Attorney's General regarding open meeting rules. COS stated she would ask to have a presentation at the next Advisory Board Meeting.

Member Ward indicated he would be withdrawing from the Advisory Board. Member Clifton stated she had reapplied.

IV. Approval of October 19, 2022 Meeting Minutes.

Chair Gray asked for a Motion to approve the October 19, 2022 Meeting Minutes.

Upon a motion by Vice Chair Bowles, seconded by Member Ward, the Minutes of October 19, 2022 meeting were unanimously approved.

V. Advisory Board member Facilitator Reports.

Member Ward mentioned that the market has been tough but is starting to see increased activity. There has been a high number of new home build cancellations.

Vice Chair Bowles stated that he has heard a lot of very positive compliments regarding Commissioner Dettorre outreach travels throughout the state. They have been well received and appreciated by all. Member Rosales stated that travel on state per diem is not generous so the effort involved should be commended.

Member Clifton noted as a result of the number of layoffs in the mortgage industry it has caused huge panic and a trickle-down effect in the real estate industry. She stated there has been a lot of cancellations and agents are expressing concern. She had received a call but directed the caller to ADRE.

Member Rosales stated he has received many questions regarding where the market is going but noted that new construction is booming in Yuma.

Member Jackson stated in Flagstaff/Coconino County they are seeing a lot of issues with fraudulent land listings in the Multiple Listing Service (MLS). Member Jackson is able to access these fraudulent listings and delete them. Member Clifton stated this is happening in Tucson/Pima County as well. Member Clifton also indicated there is a lack of disclosure when an LLC is purchasing a property and not disclosing that a licensee is participating in the transaction.

Chair Gray stated he had one call regarding a broker having trouble completing his broker audit declaration. He directed the individual to COS Hansen and the matter was resolved.

Chair Gray stated there has been legislation (not in Arizona) requiring brokers to carry workers compensation. Member Shipley asked if that requirement was based on the employee status. Chair Gray stated he believed so.

Chair Gray inquired whether someone who lived on tribal land would need to provide legal presence. COS Hansen indicated yes, the Native Nations do issue an acceptable card. Chair Gray then asked how someone may reach an Advisory Board Member and asked if their phone numbers should be made available. Member Gray, Member Clifton and DC Knupp all stated that was already available on the website <https://azre.gov/about/advisory-board>.

VI. Approval of the Advisory Board's Letter to the Governor

Member Ward stated the letter was well done. Chair Gray stated it speaks to the efficiency and effectiveness of the Department. Member Clifton stated it spoke to the ability of the Commissioner to step in and perform his responsibilities seamlessly. Vice Chair Bowles motioned to approved, seconded by Member Ward.

VII. Arizona Department of Real Estate Reports;

DC Knupp recognized Commissioner Dettorre's over 11 years of dedicated service to ADRE and the State of Arizona.

DC Knupp noted that Commissioner Dettorre's replacement had withdrawn and nothing has been announced.

DC Knupp provided a brief overview of the bills currently monitored by ADRE.

Vice Chair Bowles inquired if there were any with a significant red flags. DC Knupp iterated the Department's neutrality on all legislative proposals.

Chair Gray stated there is one that if you have paid your mortgage you never have to pay property tax.

DC Knupp stated as a Department we will continue to march forward and recognized the great staff that makes it possible.

COS Hansen concurred with DC Knupp and noted that losing Commissioner Dettorre is a great loss to the Department.

MLS McCormick thanked DC Knupp and COS Hansen for recognizing her staff and agreed that it is a great group to work with.

Commissioner Dettorre arrived and stated "It's been an honor to serve the Department for 11 years. There will always be obstacles and challenges but it has been very rewarding to be part of a very important industry and I continue to wish the Department well".

Chair Gray stated "it's been a tremendous ride over the last 11 years" and added Commissioner Dettorre has "always treated people with integrity and respect".

VIII. Nominations and Elections of 2023 Advisory Board Chair and Vice Chair

Member Ward nominated Member Clifton as Chair and Member Bowles as Vice Chair.

Member Clifton nominated Vice Chair Bowles as Chair.

Vice Chair Bowles nominated Member Clifton as Vice Chair.

Present Members voted by paper. Member appearing telephonically emailed DC Knupp. Votes counted by DC Knupp and verified by Chandni Bhakta;

Chair – Kim Clifton

Vice Chair- Charlie Bowles

IX. Consideration/Discussion of Key topics impacting ADRE in 2023

Member Clifton stated she hopes that Commissioner Dettorre does move forward as the new Commissioner but the Advisory Board members are the historians and represent everyone and will continue to keep the goodwill with the Arizona Association of REALTORS®. Chair Gray stated real estate is greater than just residential. Member Rosales stated he had nothing to suggest at this time.

Commissioner Dettorre stated to please let the Department know when there is a question and to continue the well-established connection with the Department.

DC Knupp asked members to send any feedback to now Chair-elect Clifton to add to the next agenda.

X. Call to the public

Member of the Public Salgat stated that the Arizona Association of REALTORS® has just released new forms.

XI. Next Scheduled Meeting – April 19, 2023

XII. Adjournment 11:15

Motion to adjourn Chair Clifton, seconded by Member Ward.

Respectfully submitted this 19th day of April, 2023

Real Estate Advisory Board

Kim Clifton, Chair