

## Arizona Real Estate Advisory Board Meeting Minutes

Wednesday  
May 18, 2022  
10:00 a.m. - Noon  
Arizona Department of Real Estate  
Telephonically- Google Meet and In  
Person  
100 North 15<sup>th</sup> Avenue Suite 201  
Phoenix, Arizona 85007

### I. Call to Order – Bill Gray, Chair

Chair Gray called the meeting to order at 10:05 am.

### II. Introductions & Welcome

Bill Gray, Chair

Charlie Bowles, Vice Chair

Kim Clifton - Telephonically

Carla Bowen - Telephonically

Luis Ramirez – Telephonically

Justin Rollins - Telephonically

#### **Absent:**

Karen Bohler

D. Christopher Ward

Randy Rogers

#### **ADRE Representatives present:**

Louis Dettorre, Commissioner

James Knupp, Deputy Commissioner (DC)

Abby Hansen, Chief of Staff (COS)

Chandni Bhakta, Legislative Liaison

### III. Approval of April 20, 2022 Meeting Minutes.

Chair Gray asked for a Motion to approve the April 20, 2022 Meeting Minutes. All members in attendance stated they had not reviewed the minutes. Approval tabled until July 20, 2022.

IV.

Chair Gray asked if the Board wants to request that the Commissioner update the CE categories.

Vice Chair Bowles stated “yes” and referred to the time the Broker education requirements were updated and how successful that was. Member Bowen asked the Commissioner if the State was still in a no rule change status. Commissioner Dettorre stated a moratorium on rulemaking remains in place. Member Bowen then continued that she thinks that taking all of the CE categories at one time is too big of an undertaking to take on at once and has mixed feelings.

Chair Gray stated this is just the renewal hours. Member Bowen stated the most critical should be identified and be addressed rather than the whole 24 required hours.

Member Clifton inquired whether the Education Advisory Committee (EAC) still existed. Chair Gray stated “yes”. Member Clifton then stated that she was confused at what Chair Gray is asking for. Chair Gray stated the Advisory Board had two roles; advise and evaluate the Commissioner.

Member Ramirez asked if this issue was in response to something, or did the Board come up with it? He stated he missed how this became the number one focus of the Board. Chair Gray stated he presented the question in January and then had it placed on the April agenda.

Member Ramirez stated that he feels that it requires a broader outreach within the entire real estate sector including residential, commercial, industrial and he sees it as a seismic change.

Member Rollins thought it was worth looking into further. Chair Gray asked Member Rollins for his view of the current hours. Member Rollins stated he does not want to increase hours but would like to see an improvement in the offering.

Vice Chair Bowles indicated that what it took to increase the Broker renewal hours was magnanimous and took two years to complete. He questioned if the CE’s are currently covering what is current and important to the industry now.

Member Clifton stated without a doubt education is the key and asked if the Commissioner needs direction to look at the current process and approvals. Commissioner Dettorre states rules are required to be reviewed and recommendations made every five years, through the Governor’s Regulatory Review Council. Commissioner Dettorre further stated that the Department approaches policy changes, such as education categories from a collaborative approach with all stakeholders and plans to review categories based on the feedback received, including feedback from this Advisory Board discussion.

Member Bowen offered that the lack of rule updates was not for lack of trying and that she was leery, and felt that this should be addressed legislatively and be a statewide initiative. Chair Gray stated the Board needs to look forward ten years. Member Bowen stated it should move to the EAC for consideration. Member Clifton noted the next EAC meeting was June 8, 2022.

Chair Gray stated that he was not sure the EAC was the appropriate group as they need a mindset to look ten years in the future.

Member Rollins stated he concurs with asking the Commissioner to forward to the EAC.

Member Bowles stated that was probably the best way.

Chair Gray asked if there was a motion.

Discussion amongst the Members occurred. Member Clifton submitted the following motion;

“I recommend that the Commissioner take into consideration if any changes need to be presented to the Education Advisory Board to review the present continuing education and recommend any changes, if any, to present to the Advisory Board.”

Member Bowen seconded the motion.

Chair Gray asked for a vote.

Chair Gray- yea

Vice Chair Bowles- yea

Member Bowen- opposed

Member Clifton- opposed

Member Ramirez- opposed

Member Rollins- yea

The motion failed with a tie.

Chair Gray indicated Agenda Item V depended on passage of Agenda Item IV and was made moot by IV's failing.

V. Call to the Public

Member of the public Barb Freestone stated it should be discussed by the EAC annually and encourages the Commissioner (stating she knows he will) to bring up the topic.

VI. Next Scheduled Meeting – July 20, 2022

VII. Adjournment at 11:10

Motion to adjourn by Vice Chair Bowles, seconded by Member Bowen.

*Respectfully submitted this 20th day of June, 2022*

*Real Estate Advisory Board*

---

*Bill Gray, Chair*